

Global report on the study of regulations, reports and local documentation on digital accessibility in partners' countries

Project acronym:	WAMDIA
Project full title:	We All Make Digital Information Accessible
Grant agreement no.:	2017-1-ES01-KA202-038673
Responsible:	UAH
Contributors:	It-Study, Szalmalk, DMC-Metrix, SMEBox, PRISM, Caip Doc-it, DG de Formación, Consejería de Economía, Empleo y Hacienda, C. Madrid
Document Reference:	IO1-A1
Version:	1.2
Date:	30/09/2018



History

<i>Version</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Modification reason</i>	<i>Modified by</i>
0.1	10/04/2018	Initial aggregated draft without Swedish contribution	UAH
0.2	16/04/2018	Reviewed draft without Swedish contribution	UAH
0.3	10/05/2018	Reviewed draft with Swedish contribution and addition for Italian report	UAH
0.4	14/06/2018	Reviewed and enhanced introduction and conclusions	UAH
0.5	26/06/2018	Consistency analysis of contributions	UAH
0.6	20/07/2018	Final check for draft	UAH
1.0	23/07/2018	Version for peer review	UAH
1.1	23/07/2018	Little changes asked by partners	UAH
1.2	30/09/2018	Changes to implement suggestions by external reviewer	UAH



Reviews

<i>Referred version of the document</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Reviewer (partner)</i>	<i>Synthesis of comments (add your full comments in the text with note mode)</i>
0.1	16/4/2018	Luis Fernández (UAH)	Review of 0.1 and edition of introduction and conclusions
0.4	14/06/2018	Luis Fernández (UAH)	Review of 0.3 and enhanced edition of introduction and conclusions
0.5	26/06/2018	Luis Fernández (UAH)	Review of 0.4 and enhanced edition of introduction and conclusions
0.6	21/07/2018	Luis Fernández (UAH)	Review of 0.5 and enhanced final edition of introduction and conclusions
1.0	23/07/2018	All partners	Peer review
1.1	26/09/2018	External reviewer	Revised version for external review with minor changes required
1.2	05/10/2018	External reviewer	Acceptance of implementation of her suggestions of changes as expressed in external review report



Table of contents

HISTORY	2
REVIEWS.....	3
TABLE OF CONTENTS	4
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS.....	5
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	6
1. INTRODUCTION.....	7
2. RESULTS.....	8
2.1 HUNGARY.....	8
2.1.1 <i>Introduction</i>	8
2.1.2 <i>Regulation related to digital accessibility in Hungary</i>	8
2.1.3 <i>Conclusion</i>	11
2.1.4 <i>References</i>	11
2.2 IRELAND.....	12
2.2.1 <i>Introduction</i>	12
2.2.2 <i>Regulation related to digital accessibility in Ireland</i>	12
2.2.3 <i>Public Services Access for People with Disabilities</i>	14
2.2.4 <i>Conclusion</i>	15
2.2.5 <i>References</i>	15
2.3 ITALY	16
2.3.1 <i>Introduction</i>	16
2.3.2 <i>Regulation about digital accessibility in Italy</i>	16
2.3.3 <i>Conclusion</i>	19
2.3.4 <i>References</i>	19
2.4 SPAIN	21
2.4.1 <i>Introduction</i>	21
2.4.2 <i>Regulation related to digital accessibility in Spain</i>	21
2.4.3 <i>Regulation about digital accessibility in the Education field in General</i>	22
2.4.4 <i>Regulation about digital accessibility in Government and public organisations</i>	23
2.4.5 <i>Regulation about digital accessibility in Education iVET and CVET</i>	26
2.5 SWEDEN	29
2.5.1 <i>Introduction</i>	29
2.5.2 <i>Regulation about digital accessibility in Sweden</i>	29
2.5.3 <i>Conclusions</i>	32
2.5.4 <i>References</i>	32
2 CONCLUSIONS.....	34



List of abbreviations

<Abbreviation>	<Explanation>
EQF	European Qualification Framework
VET	Vocational Education and Training
IVET	Initial Vocational Education and Training
CVET	Continuous Vocational Education and Training



Executive summary

The WAMDIA project is aimed at the promotion of digital accessibility from an ICT user's perspective within the context of the historical moment when European Union must implement the Directive 2016/2012 which promote some minimum common standards in digital accessibility for websites, mobile applications and office and media files served to the public from governmental and authorities' websites or from websites supported by public funds (e.g. EU projects, national funded projects, etc.). Not all the European countries start from the same point of development of digital accessibility in terms of promotion or regulation by national and local authorities: for example, some have from long ago specific legislation which makes compulsory the respect to some standards of digital accessibility in publicly funded websites while in others digital accessibility is mainly something voluntary although encouraged and supported in some way by the authorities.

The analysis of the national reports generated by the partners is a key information for the design of the main intellectual outputs of the WAMDIA project: the awareness campaign and the training courses on digital accessibility for ICT users. The information enables the adjustment of those products to the local reality in each country. The information collected by the partners confirms that the regulations in the partners' countries are very different, so we can expect that different levels of awareness and even training in the different countries. However, these initial conclusions must be contrasted with the results of the survey and the interviews to individuals which are planned for the activity IO1-A2: the general legal and regulatory frame may have or not equivalent real impact on individual and organisational culture and behaviour although it is logical to assume the more regulation the more awareness and practice in digital accessibility.



1. Introduction

When looking at the legal aspects of digital accessibility (i.e. what is referred to regulations and legislation as expressions of governmental policies related to accessibility) we can analyse how the digital accessibility is understood, which policies are implemented and under which circumstances to promote or enforce it, etc. Laws related to digital accessibility are normally aimed at supporting and protecting the civil rights of people with disabilities or with special needs in general. Daily life in the 21st century is deeply founded on the digital space, and without accessibility, basic human rights are diminished or completely denied. These include the right to education, employment, public services, health care, financial privacy, community, travel and more. However, digital accessibility has been traditionally linked to website accessibility at the beginning of governmental actions to ensure access to digital information for all.

Considering web accessibility as starting point for a comparison of the regulation and legislation on digital accessibility in the different countries, we can find online resources acting as repositories of information on laws and legal dispositions on accessibility. The most remarkable one is [W3 WAI](#) created in a collaborative way. One quick look at the information reveals how the development of legal dispositions in favour of digital accessibility varies a lot among the different countries. Being conscious of this reality, we wanted to analyse which is the situation in each of the partners' countries before the transposition of the new EU Directive 2016/2102. It is clear that those countries with longer tradition of promotion of digital accessibility, especially if it is enforced by clear legal regulations have a more solid starting point in the path to accessibility and in the support of the changes that the new EU Directive entering into force on 23rd September 2018, will represent for the stakeholders.

This document presents the review of legal dispositions on digital accessibility in the 5 EU countries of the consortium: namely, Spain, Hungary, Italy, Sweden and Ireland. This set of countries represents a good variety of country types in terms of culture and geographical location, economic development, etc. The analysis has concentrated its attention on the three main target fields: VET education (both initial and life-long learning and continuous training for employment), education in general and governmental and public administration. This information will be contrasted with the data collected from the main target groups for the project through the activity A2 of this Intellectual Output IO1 using an online survey and direct interviews to experts and key representatives of public employees and managers, VET teachers and managers and SME employees and managers. The document functions as a collection of actual and authentic information on the field of digital accessibility of people with special needs.

There is a common fact to all the analysed countries: they all have ratified the United Nations' Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD) so this convention will be not mentioned in each country section.

The results of this analysis will better guide the two main actions of the project: the awareness campaign and the training courses on digital accessibility for ICT users. This information will enable the adjustment of those products to the local reality in each country.



2. Results

2.1 Hungary

2.1.1 Introduction

The desk research contains references of Hungarian legislation acts in the following areas:

- education in general
- vocational education and training
- public administration

The process started with determining the data from where the information was obtained, thus the following are the main sources of the research: Hungarian acts, regulations, resolutions and government strategies. The document lists the relevant legislative findings with direct references as well as comments and explanations where it is necessary.

2.1.2 Regulation related to digital accessibility in Hungary

2.1.2.1 Act CLXXXVII of year 2011 on vocational training¹

The Act is the most important legislation on Hungarian vocational education and training which replaced the previous Act on vocational training of 1993. Generally speaking, it is intended to widen the sphere of dual system of apprenticeship and forging closer ties between the Hungarian vocational education and economy.

The Act regulates the rights of students with special needs to a large extent, however, the digital accessibility itself mentioned only once in Section 11 as follows.

Section 11 (1):

*“Students with special educational needs (disability) have the right to receive special pedagogical services corresponding to their condition. During the whole process of vocational examination physical and **digital accessibility should be provided for students with special educational needs.**”*

2.1.2.2 Act CXC of 2011 on National Public Education²

The Act is the most important legislation on Hungarian general education which contains the basic rules for pre-schools, primary schools, grammar schools, vocational secondary schools and other institutions that provide complementary services in education (e.g. physical and conductive educational institution).

Similarly, to the Act on vocational training, this legislation also regulates the fundamental rights of students in several aspects, however, the digital accessibility itself is not mentioned in any part of the text. The following part only refers to as” tools generally used during their studies” as written below.



Section 51

*“(5) Students with special education needs and integration, learning, behavioral difficulties **shall be offered a longer preparation period at the entrance examination in justified cases; during the written or oral tests, they shall be granted the possibility to use the tools generally used during their studies; and the organization of the examination shall be adapted to their capabilities.**”*

2.1.2.3 Regulation 315/2013. On vocational examination³

The regulation complements the Act on vocational education and training and is about how to organize vocational examination. The following is a direct reference which allows additional grants for the students with special needs.

Section 7

*“Upon request **students with special educational needs have the right to take the vocational examination for a longer period** than it is set in the Examination Requirements. Students with special educational needs also **entitled to fulfill in different examination forms as oral, practical and interactive exam tasks can be interchanged corresponding to the type of disability.**”*

2.1.2.4 Regulation No 20/2012 (VIII.31.) on the operation of educational institutions and use of names of public education institutions⁴

The regulation is one of the most important complementary legislations of the Act on National Public Education. This particular section allows schools to purchase special equipment suited to the needs of students with disabilities.

2nd Appendix

*“Schools that educate students with special educational needs **allowed to set up interior building design and procure equipment that provides physical accessibility and safe environment suited to the type and extent of disability.**”*

2.1.2.5 Government Decree No. 1653/2015, National Disability Strategy (2015–2025)⁵

The decree itself a cross-sectoral ten-year long schedule that covers many legislative instructions imposed on different ministries with deadlines and tasks assigned to several responsible government bodies.

The decree also contains the list many future project activities financed by the Structural Funds. As far as the digital accessibility is concerned, the Decree **imposes tasks that aim to make digital government**



databases more compatible to one another. The decree is aligning with the European Disability Strategy (2010-2020).

2.1.2.6 Act 2012. I. on Labour Code⁶

The Act lays down the fundamental rules and principles of employment, considering the economic and social interests of employers and workers alike. The Act does not specifically cover the subject of digital accessibility, however there is a provision that provides extra working days allowance to people having certain disabilities. The following is the literally translation of that particular section:

Act 2012. I. on Labour Code, Section 120:

*“Employees having suffered a **degree of health impairment** of at least fifty per cent as diagnosed by the body rehabilitation experts shall be entitled to five working days of extra vacation time a year.”*

2.1.2.7 Act 1998. XXVI. Regulates and protects the rights of people with disabilities⁷

The Act aims to improve their social and economic integration. The digital accessibility mentioned only in Section 4 as a definition:

*“Accessibility to information is defined as meaning that people with disabilities **have equal access to any public information** with others”.*

Other articles (namely Section 6 and 7) regulates the **rights of accessibility to any public services**. It must be stressed, however, that these sections are not limited exclusively to the public sector, as **non-governmental institutions are also obliged to do so if they receive public financing**. The main instrument and most common tool to provide equal accessibility to information the websites that comply with web accessibility standards.

2.1.2.8 Regulation 305/2005. On accessibility of public sector information, public database systems, digital content products and public data integration⁸

The following Section 5 is literally translated which regulates the subjects of content design development, searching standards and website operation.

Section 5

“(1) the public data provider is required provide online content services in a way that the website should be separated from its internal databases.

(2) In case the website service is temporarily unavailable the service provider should start restoring service in business hours.



(3) The website should be developed accessible for persons who are blind or visually impaired.”

2.1.3 Conclusion

As seen above, the relevant legislative acts do state the basic principles and approaches to be followed as regard to the people with disabilities, but there is no any regulation or measure where this subject would be thoroughly specified. Moreover, the regulation tends to focus on people with disability (and not design for all) and somewhat spotted and not general.

2.1.4 References

- [1] [törvény a szakképzésről törvény a szakképzésről](#) . 2011. évi CLXXXVII
- [2] [törvény a nemzeti köznevelésről](#). 2011. évi CXC.
- [3] [Korm. rendelet a komplex szakmai vizsgáztatás szabályairól](#). 315/2013. (VIII. 28.)
- [4] [EMMI rendelet a nevelési-oktatási intézmények működéséről és a köznevelési intézmények névhasználatáról](#). 20/2012. (VIII. 31.)
- [5] [Korm. határozat, Országos Fogytékosságügyi Program \(2015–2025\)](#). 1653/2015. (IX. 14.)
- [6] [évi I. törvény a munka törvénykönyvéről](#). 2012.
- [7] [törvény a fogyatékos személyek jogairól és esélyegyenlőségük biztosításáról](#). 1998. évi XXVI.
- [8] Korm. rendelet a közérdekű adatok elektronikus közzétételére, az egységes közadatkereső rendszerre, valamint a központi jegyzék adattartalmára, az adatintegrációra vonatkozó részletes szabályokról,. 305/2005. (XII. 25.)



2.2 Ireland

2.2.1 Introduction

The desk research contains references to Irish regulations acts in the following areas:

- Digital Accessibility in Ireland.
- Public services access for people with disabilities.

In each section we can find described the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons, which is an obligation on the Irish government, and also Non-Statutory Guidelines which are accessibility guidelines available on public servers.

2.2.2 Regulation related to digital accessibility in Ireland

Regulation on digital accessibility in Ireland is light, although that does not necessarily reflect bad practice. Legislation in this area is usually focussed on general equality, forbidding discrimination on the 9 grounds (age, race/ethnic group/nationality, gender, family status, disability, marital status, sexual orientation, religion, membership of the traveller community) listed in the Equal Status Act, 2004. Much good practice is encouraged by the voluntary sector, and codes of practice adopted by governmental agencies. Schools and colleges make good efforts to accommodate students with various disabilities, adjusting the physical landscape but are just recently becoming aware of accommodations for digital accessibility. This work is, however non-compulsory and dependent on good will. Regulation about digital accessibility in Education in Ireland

Provision of education in the VET/FET sector (VET is generally known as FET (Further Education and Training) in Ireland) is subject to the following regulations:

There are 3 key pieces of legislation which deal with the rights of people with disabilities in education and employment

- 1 Equal Status Acts 2000 to 2004.
The main aim of these acts is to promote equality by forbidding discrimination in employment, vocational training, advertising, collective agreements and the provision of goods and services. People who provide services to the public (e.g. recreational services, transport or travel services, banking services etc.) cannot discriminate.
- 2 Disability Act 2005
This act places a statutory obligation on public service providers to support access to services and facilities for people with disabilities. Under the Act, people with disabilities are entitled to:
 - Have their health and educational needs assessed.
 - Have individual service statements drawn up, setting out what services they should get.
 - Access independent complaints and appeals procedures.
 - Access public buildings and public service employment.
- 3 Education for Persons with Special Educational Needs Act 2004 (No. 30 Of 2004)

(The [Education for Persons with Special Educational Needs Act 2004 \(pdf\)](#) provides for the education of children aged under 18 years with special educational needs. The Act focuses on children's education but there are references to further and adult education.)

Section 15, Planning for future education needs



(2) In performing the functions under subsection (1), the principal or the special educational needs organiser shall—

(a) Ascertain the wishes of the child concerned and of his or her parents, and

(b) Take such steps as are necessary as will enable the child to progress as a young adult to the level of education or training that meets his or her wishes or those of his or her parents and that are appropriate to his or her ability.

It established the “National Council for Special Education”

19.—(1) There shall stand established on the establishment day a body to be known as an Chomhairle Naisiunta um Oideachas Speisialta or in the English language the National Council for Special Education, and which in this Act is referred to as the “Council”, to perform the functions conferred on it by or under this Act.

... Which shall

(h) Review generally the provision made for adults with disabilities to avail of higher education and adult and continuing education, rehabilitation and training and to publish reports on the results of such reviews

In summary, this Act:

- Caters for people with special educational needs age 0-18
- Establishes the National Council for special Education with responsibility for administrating the legislation
- Confers functions on Health Boards where it is deemed that the need is a medical, not an educational need
- Provides for:
 1. The appointment of Liaison Officers between Health Boards and the Special Education Council, consulting with parents of children under 18

The aims of the Act are:

1. to make further provision for the education of people with special educational needs
2. to ensure that their education takes place, as far as possible, in an inclusive environment
3. to ensure that they have the same right as everyone else to avail of and benefit from appropriate education
4. to help children with special educational needs to leave school with the skills necessary to participate, to the level of their capacity, in an inclusive way in the social and economic activities of society and to live independent and fulfilled lives
5. to provide for the greater involvement of parents of children with special educational needs in relation to the education of their children
6. to establish the National Council for Special Education (this Council has already been set up and the Act will give it a statutory basis)



7. to confer certain functions on Health Boards in relation to the education of people with special educational needs
8. To establish an independent appeals system - the Special Education Appeals Board.

2.2.2.1 New obligations from UNCRPD

In addition, on 8th March, 2018, the Irish government ratified the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. Among many provisions about education for people with disabilities, this confers the following obligation on the Irish government:

.... (To) ensure that persons with disabilities are able to access general tertiary education, vocational training, adult education and lifelong learning without discrimination and on an equal basis with others. To this end, States Parties shall ensure that reasonable accommodation is provided to persons with disabilities.

Article 24 (5) – Education

2.2.2.2 Non- Statutory Guidelines

In addition to the legislation outlined above there are several non-statutory services and guidelines which are effective in Ireland in improving access to education for students with special needs and disabilities

1. The National Disability Authority (NDA) Guidelines for equality of access to education
2. The Higher Education Authority Fund for Students with Disabilities

To be eligible for support under the Fund for Students with Disabilities, a learner on an approved course must meet all the following conditions:

- Have a verifiable disability in one or more of the categories as outlined below;
- As a result of the disability have a need for specific supports and/or assistance arising from study or attendance on the chosen course.

2.2.3 Public Services Access for People with Disabilities

2.2.3.1 Non-Statutory Guidelines

The National Disability Authority has produced guidelines on accessibility in online public services, aims to show how Universal Design processes and techniques can be progressively used to enable more people to use online public services with ease and satisfaction.

Public sector website accessibility in Ireland is managed by voluntary publication of accessibility policies, and individual government departments and agencies have their own accessibility statements. For example:

- [Dept of Taoiseach](#). Accessibility Statement:
 “The Department of the Taoiseach recognizes the importance of ensuring that our site is accessible to everyone and is committed to achieving a minimum of conformance level Double-A with the Web Accessibility Initiative (WAI) [Web Content Accessibility Guidelines](#) and complying with the [National Disability Authority IT Accessibility Guidelines](#).”



- [Department of Communications, Climate Action and Environment \(DCCA\)](#). Accessibility Statement:

“We commit to providing a website that is accessible to the widest possible audience, regardless of technology or ability. This means that all users should have equal access to the information we provide and website functionality. We actively work to increase the accessibility and usability of our website and maintain it to a high standard.”

In addition, the government has produced a [National Digital Strategy](#), which emphasizes the desirability of public service websites being fully accessible, but to date this is not enshrined in law.

2.2.4 Conclusion

In summary, there is much good practice evidenced in provision of education to people with disabilities and in giving them equal access to public services online. However, much of this is provided for on a voluntary and good will basis, so there is a need for the national legislation that will follow the EU General Directive on Web Accessibility, and a programme of awareness, training and certification in accessibility of all web and educational resources.

2.2.5 References

- [9] [Equal Status Acts 2000 to 2015, No. 43 of 2015, s. 16\(4\), prohibiting discrimination in the provision of goods and services, the provision of accommodation and access to education, Government Publications - The Office of Public Works](#)
- [10] [Disability Act 2005, July 8, 2005, No. 14 of 2005, Government Publications - The Office of Public Works](#)
- [11] [Education for Persons with Special Educational Needs Act 2004, No. 30 of 2004, Government Publications - The Office of Public Works](#)
- [12] [United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities](#),
- [13] [National Disability Authority: Guidance for Online Public Services](#)



2.3 Italy

2.3.1 Introduction

The document gives an overview of national laws, decrees, government strategies and general information related to digital accessibility of people with special needs in Italy. The Italian Law 9, January 2004, n. 4 also known as “Stanca Act”, offers the main legal framework to address and regulate digital accessibility in Italy. The document provides reference links to the full text of mentioned documents and publications where more detailed information on digital accessibility can be found and further analysed.

2.3.2 Regulation about digital accessibility in Italy

The accessibility to digital information in VET is subjected to the following regulations:

Rights of persons with disabilities:

- Law 5 February 1992 n. 104 on assistance, social integration and rights of persons with disabilities [14]. The law 104/92 is the Italian framework law on disability. It defines general principles (art. 1, 2, 5) and provides for measures on caring (art. 7), social inclusion (art. 8), right to education (art. 12, 13, 14, 15, 16), vocational training (art. 17), working policies (art.18), accessibility of sports and recreational activities (art. 23), accessibility of built environment (art. 24)
- Law 9 January 1989, n. 13, Measures in order to remove obstacles in private buildings [15]. This law provides for the adoption of administrative measures to improve accessibility of buildings.

Digital accessibility:

- Ministerial Decree 20 March 2013, Technical Requires and Levels for ICT tools accessibility [16]. This decree dictates technical criteria on web accessibility to complement Italian Law n. 4/2004 on web accessibility.
- Regulation 1 March 2005 n. 75 [17], Decree of the President of the Republic, to facilitate the web accessibility for disabled.
- Ministerial Decree 08 July 2005, Technical Requires and Levels for ICT tools accessibility [18].
- Legislative Decree 07 March 2005, n. 82, Digital Administration Code [19]. The CAD establishes ‘a statute of the digital citizen’ (including natural and legal persons), by requiring public offices, agencies and bodies to interact in a digital manner, thus to arrange appropriate means from the technical and organizational point of view to meet citizens’ requests.
- Law 09 January 2004, n. 4 [20], “Provisions to support the access to information technologies for the disabled”

2.3.2.1 Focus: the Stanca Act “Provisions to support the access to information technologies for the disabled”

In Italy, web accessibility is ruled by the so-called "Legge Stanca" (Stanca Act), formally Act n.4 of 9 January 2004, officially published on the Gazzetta Ufficiale on 17 January 2004, also known as “Provisions to support the access to information technologies for the disabled [21]”. The original Stanca Act was based on the WCAG 1.0. The act states that the government protects each person’s right to access all sources of information and services independent of disability. The law clarifies and extends the rights of disabled to



access public services via the Internet in line with the principles of equality established in Article 3 of the Italian Constitution.

The provisions included in this law apply, in addition to public administration, to other economic public organizations, to private companies that provide public services, to regional city-controlled companies, public care institutes and rehabilitation organizations, State-controlled transportation and communication companies, and information services providers [22]. The provisions of the law do not apply to private sector organizations, except those in the transport or telecom sector that have partial government ownership. At the national level, the implementation of the law is monitored by the Department for Innovation and Technology; at the regional, provincial and municipality levels, each organization is responsible for overseeing their own implementation of the Act. The Stanca Act required that covered web sites provide accessibility in line with the recommendations of the European Union – specifically WCAG 1.0.

Article 1 contains a clear reference to the principles of non-discrimination which are imbued in the Italian Constitution and acknowledges the right everyone has to access to public information and services.

Article 2 provides definitions for the terms “accessibility” and “assistive technologies” while article 3 lists the addressees of this act. To simplify, we could say that those who are involved in the enforcement of the law are all the public bodies and agencies, both national and local. The law also applies to private subjects, if they are concessionaries of public information or services, and to public transport and telecommunications companies.

Article 4 is probably one of the most important since it points out the obligations and duties regarding accessibility and inclusion in the case of public procurement of IT goods and services. In particular, when purchasing ICT goods and services, signing contracts regarding their development and maintenance or carrying out competitive tenders, the accessibility requirements must always be taken into consideration.

At this point there are two different levels of obligation: on one hand, the compliance with the accessibility requirements is mandatory for public Web sites (and in general for Web applications) and whenever private or public subjects draw on public grants for the procurement of ICT equipment and tools explicitly meant for disabled users or workers.

In every other case of competitive tender regarding IT procurement, the administration must simply give preference to the bidder which offers the best compliance with the accessibility requirements in the event of similar technical offers. Public agencies must eventually provide an adequate justification for not taking the accessibility requirements into account or for buying a product that fails to reach compliance.

Any stipulated contract failing to respect such mechanism may be declared null and void and this may also entail both executive responsibilities and disciplinary actions, as well as civil liability provided for by the current anti-discrimination laws (article 9). The most important anti-discrimination act in Italy is Legislative Decree No. 67/2006 “Judiciary measures to protect disabled people against discrimination”, amendment of Legislative Decree No. 196/2003 which mainly dealt with work discrimination. An important point in this article is the commitment to provide disabled workers with adequate IT equipment in order to allow them to work efficiently.



Article 5 recalls the importance of accessibility in the sector of education including the production of teaching tools, courseware and electronic textbooks.

Article 6 fosters the voluntary commitment of the private sector to this law and articles 7 and 8 assign duties and explain how to support, monitor and enforce the provisions of the law both at national and at local level stressing the need to spread the culture of e-Inclusion through positive actions and training courses.

Articles 10 and 11 provide for the writing of two decrees containing the enforcement regulations and the technical accessibility requirements while article 12 explicitly reminds that these requirements could be updated and that they should be compatible with and inspired by other relevant national and international recommendations on accessibility.

2.3.2.2 Decree of the President of the Republic, March 1st, 2005, No. 75

The “Enforcement Regulations for Law 4/2004 to promote the access of the disabled to information technologies.” goes further into the topics regarding the implementation of the provisions of Law 4/2004. The most important accomplishment of this decree is the introduction the key concept of usability. Web sites must not only be barrier-free but also simple, effective, efficient and they must satisfy the user’s needs. In order to give visibility to the most accessible and usable Web sites, a national accessibility mark was established along with a list of trusted accessibility evaluators held by the National Centre for Informatics in Public Administration. Private subjects must necessarily apply for an accessibility assessment made by a member of the evaluators’ list to obtain the accessibility mark. Public agencies and bodies instead may autonomously assess their compliance with the accessibility requirements and with the provisions of the law, in adherence to the principle of self-government.

2.3.2.3 Ministerial Decree, July 8th, 2005

As part of the Stanca Act, the Minister for Innovation and Technologies was directed to provide detailed guidelines that describe the technical requirements, different levels of accessibility and technical methodologies to verify the accessibility of Internet websites. These standards were established in the Ministerial Decree July 8, 2005, which defined technical requirements and different levels of accessibility of computer tools. These standards were published in Official Gazette n. 183 on August 8, 2005. The standards broadly utilize WCAG 1.0 A and Section 508 requirements as a baseline to define the level of accessibility required for public facing web sites, software applications, operating system and self-service machines – broadly the same set of technologies covered by Section 508.

2.3.2.4 Ministerial Decree 20 March 2013 Technical Requires and Levels for ICT tools accessibility

On 20 March 2013 this decree dictates technical criteria on web accessibility to complement Italian Law n. 4/2004 on web accessibility. The standards required by the Stanca Act were updated to the WCAG 2.0. The technical requirements for web accessibility copy the WCAG 2.0 Level AA success criteria and conformance criteria. It expands on use of Web standards for technologies compatible with accessibility by referencing ISO/IEC 15545:2000 (HTML), ISO/IEC 16262:2002 (ECMA-script), and additional W3C standards for HTML 4.01, XHTML 1.0, CSS 1.0, XML, SVG, and SMIL. More current versions of these standards are also allowable.



2.3.2.5 Resources for implementing accessibility

The Italian government provides a variety of resources for implementing accessibility as part of the “Pubbliaccesso” website [23]. This site is maintained by the CNIPA, which is a central government coordinating body for IT issues. The Pubbliaccesso site includes a variety of resources on developing and deploying accessible web sites. Pubbliaccesso also includes the official list of Stanca Act auditors that can issue certifications on accessibility with respect to the Stanca Act requirements.

2.3.2.6 Declaration of Internet Rights

Italy was the first European country to produce a “Declaration of Internet Rights” in July 2015, in a bid to increase awareness of digital rights and inspire legislative actions. The nonbinding declaration includes provisions that promote net neutrality and establish internet access as a fundamental right.

2.3.3 Conclusion

In Italy a great contribution was surely given by the positive influence of the Law 09 January 2004, n. 4, “Provisions to support the access to information technologies for the disabled” and its updates, proving to be a valid measure to foster digital accessibility. However, according to the latest available data, only 5% of Italy's institutional websites are accessible. The main problems include: PDF image documents; sections of pages that aren't accessible with a keyboard; menus, buttons and links that aren't labelled and therefore aren't accessible to those with disabilities who use assistive technologies such as screen readers for those with partial or total blindness. Not to mention films and videos without audio descriptions or subtitles for the deaf, and language that's too complicated for people with cognitive difficulties [24]. Raising awareness on digital inclusion could be an effective success factor to build an adequate culture of inclusiveness: events, training courses, learning resources and aiding toolkits should be highly promoted at all levels of society.

2.3.4 References

- [14] Legge-quadro per l'assistenza, l'integrazione sociale e i diritti delle persone handicappate”, GU.17 febbraio 1992, n. 39, S.O.
- [15] Disposizioni per favorire il superamento e l'eliminazione delle barriere architettoniche negli edifici privati. GU n.21 del 26-1-1989
- [16] Decreto ministeriale 20 marzo 2013, modifiche all'allegato A del decreto 8 luglio 2005 del Ministro per l'innovazione e le tecnologie, recante: «Requisiti tecnici e i diversi livelli per l'accessibilità agli strumenti informatici» (GU Serie Generale n.217 del 16-9-2013).
- [17] Decreto del Presidente della Repubblica 1 marzo 2005 n.75 Regolamento di attuazione della Legge 9 gennaio 2004, n. 4, per favorire l'accesso dei soggetti disabili agli strumenti informatici (G.U. 3 maggio 2005, n. 101
- [18] Decreto Ministeriale 8 luglio 2005. (Ministro per l'Innovazione e le tecnologie) Requisiti tecnici e i diversi livelli per l'accessibilità agli strumenti informatici, (G.U. 8 agosto 2005, n. 183)
- [19] Decreto legislativo 7 marzo 2005, n. 82 (Codice dell'amministrazione digitale – CAD



- [20] Legge 09 gennaio 2004, n. 4 (Legge Stanca), recante «Disposizioni per favorire l'accesso dei soggetti disabili agli strumenti informatici» (G.U. n. 13 del 17 gennaio 2004)
- [21] Disposizioni per favorire l'accesso dei soggetti disabili agli strumenti informatici
- [22] United Nations, Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, "[Consideration of reports submitted by States parties under article 35 of the Convention - Initial reports of State parties due in 2011 - Italy](#)". 2013.
- [23] [Agenzia per l'Italia Digitale](#)
- [24] [An invisible obstacle for Italy's charter of Internet rights](#)
- [25] Law n. 4, January 9, 2004, "Provisions to support the access to information technologies for the disabled". Official Gazette n.13 on 17 January 2004.
- [26] Decree of the President of the Republic, March 1st 2005, No. 75, "Enforcement Regulations for Law 4/2004 to promote the access of the disabled to information technologies". Official Gazette n. 101 on 3 May 2005.
- [27] Ministerial Decree, July 8 2005, Guidelines on technical requirements and different levels of accessibility of computer tools. Official Gazette n. 183 on 8 August 2005.
- [28] Ministerial Decree 20 March 2013, Technical Requires and Levels for ICT tools accessibility. Official Gazette n.217 on 16-9-2013.
- [29] [Steven Sintini - National Centre for IT in Public Administration, Legislation on eAccessibility: the Italian approach](#), 2014.
- [30] [OHCHR, Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities](#), 2008.
- [31] [Italian Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Directorate-General for Development Cooperation \(MFA-DGCS\), "Italian Development Cooperation Disability Action Plan"](#), 2013.
- [32] United Nations, Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, "[Consideration of reports submitted by States parties under article 35 of the Convention - Initial reports of State parties due in 2011 - Italy](#)". 2013



2.4 Spain

2.4.1 Introduction

The desk research contains references to Spanish legislation acts in the following areas:

- Regulation related to digital accessibility in Spain
- Regulation about digital accessibility in the Education field in General
- Regulation about digital accessibility in Government and public organisations
- Regulation about digital accessibility in Education iVET and CVET

2.4.2 Regulation related to digital accessibility in Spain

The digital accessibility is also included in general regulation of websites for the Public Administration

- Preamble III of Law 56/2007 [22] in consolidated text published on 28th December 2013, indicates that it includes a reviewed, updated and enhanced version of regulation referred to webpages to ensure accessibility of digital information y for disabled and elder people.
 - The 3th Additional Provision of the Law 56/2007 [22] indicates that all the webpages of Public Administration (all state authorities and organisms at national, regional and local level) will satisfy the medium level of the accessibility criteria: only exceptions allowed will be the functionalities or services where no technical solution for accessibility is available. This is also applicable to all webpages totally or partially funded by the Public Administration as well as the ones from entities and companies in charge of managing public services. This will be specifically compulsory for the webpages of all public educational, training and university centres as well as those educational and training centres which get public funds. Public webpages must inform users of their accessibility level and must provide a contact to express any access difficulty to webpages, claims and suggestions for improvement.
 - The 5th Additional Provision of the Law 56/2007 [22] states that Public Administration will promote awareness campaigns as well as education and training programs for promoting other webpages progressively adopt accessibility criteria. Failing to fulfil accessibility obligations will be subjected to the regulation of infraction and fines related to the act of equal opportunities, non-discrimination and universal accessibility for disabled people. The regulation will be also applicable to those companies which provide especially relevant services to the public, so they have to reach the medium level of the accessibility criteria.
 - The 11th Additional Provision [22] prescribe that the Public Administration has to promote accessibility standards for disabled people and the design for all in all processes and elements of new ICT services in the Information Society.
- Law 51/2003 [23], of December 2, on equal opportunities, non-discrimination and universal accessibility for people with disabilities, understands universal accessibility as the condition that they must meet the environments, processes, goods, products and services, as well as the objects or instruments, tools and devices, to be comprehensible, usable and practicable by all people in conditions of security and comfort and in the most autonomous and natural way possible. Adopts the "design for all" strategy and is understood without prejudicing the reasonable adjustments that must be made. The Law contains a whole plan for general accessibility in transportation, buildings, etc.



- Law 51/2003 [23], of December 2, in its 7th Final Disposition says that the Government in a maximum of 2 years will establish the basic accessibility conditions for access and use of technologies, products and services related to the Information Society and social communication media, to be compulsory in period of 4-6 years from the publication of this Law for all new services and products and in 8-10 years for those already existing ones which require a reasonable adjustment.
- Law 51/2003 [23], of December 2, on equal opportunities, non-discrimination and universal accessibility for people with disabilities in its 10th Final Disposition talks about a training curriculum on universal accessibility and the subsequent training of professionals and states that the Government in a maximum time period of 2 years from this Law will develop a training curriculum on “design for all” for all educational programs, included the ones in universities, to enable the training of professionals of all fields including the design and construction in the physical environment, infrastructures and public works, transportation, communications and telecommunications and services for the Information Society.

2.4.3 Regulation about digital accessibility in the Education field in General

- The Organic Law 3/2007 [24] superseded the Law 51/2003 but it did not mention accessibility.
- The Organic Law 2/2006 [25], of May 3, on Education (known as LOE) establishes that the general regulation of education in Spain. Some of the relevant actions included in the Law are:
 - Exams for the access to Universities will be accessible for students with disability (Art. 38.3). The same applied to exams for secondary education diploma for people over 18 (Art. 68.2) and for VET and other post compulsory secondary education (Art. 69.2).
 - In Art. 110 it is said that existing educational centres that do not meet the conditions of accessibility required by current legislation on the subject, should be adjusted in time and in accordance with the criteria established by the Law 51/2003 [23]; the educational public authorities will promote programs to adapt physical conditions, including transportation schools, and technological centres, and will equip them with the resources and access to the curriculum appropriate to the needs of students, especially in the case of people with disabilities, so that they do not become a factor of discrimination and guarantee an inclusive and universally accessible service to all students.
 - In Art 111b referred to ICT in education, the Law states that all e-learning or virtual platforms for education which in any direct or indirect way are supported by public funds have to guarantee accessibility and design for all people.
- The Organic Law 8/2013 [26], of May 3, on Improvement of Education (known as LOMCE) mostly confirms the same points stated in the previous LOE, just adding that
 - The preamble states that general integration of ICT will be guided by the principles of design for all and universal accessibility.
 - Art. 1.b adds that it is necessary not only guaranteeing equality but also acting on unbalances of personal, social, etc. conditions especially those caused by disability.

2.4.3.1 References

[33] Law 56/2007, 28th December 2007 with consolidated text published on 28th December 2013, Measures for promotion of the Information Society. BOE 29th December 2007, pag. 53701-53719.



- [34] Law 51/2003, 2nd December, equality of opportunities, no discrimination and universal accessibility for people with disability. BOE 3rd December 2003, pag. 43187-43195.
- [35] Organic Law 3/2007, 22nd March, for effective equality between men and women. BOE 23rd March, 2007, pag. 12611-12645.
- [36] Organic Law 2/2006, 3rd May on Education. BOE 4th May 2006, pag. 14-67.
- [37] Organic Law 8/2013, 9th December on Improvement of Education. BOE 10th December, 2013, pag. 97858-97921

2.4.4 Regulation about digital accessibility in Government and public organisations

In recent years the social position towards disability has been changing progressively, many countries in which legislation and rules are created necessary for disabled people to be an active part of society.

In Spain, new laws have been developed by which discrimination is understood as any distinction designed to obstruct equal conditions in all areas. Although it is not always carried out, the modifications and adaptations necessary and adequate to guarantee the exercise of a right of equal conditions are clearly defined.

Let's not forget that from a social point of view, the opinion is frequent that disabled people are a minority. However, it is important to know that only in Spain there are more than 4 million people who suffer some type of disability according to the latest data published by the National Institute of Statistics (INE). In addition, the use of accessible technologies, according to a study by Microsoft and Forrester Research (Microsoft and Forrester Research 2003), benefits more than 60% of people with medium and severe disabilities.

On December 13, 2016, the 10th anniversary of the approval by Spain of the International Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities was fulfilled. This fact meant a greater recognition and guarantee of the rights of persons with disabilities.

One of the areas where standards and laws are most applied is in the field of education, especially in Universities where there is continuous and collaborative work to dilute the line between ICT inclusion and exclusion. However, this document will address standards and laws, their modifications and level of implementation in the environment of Spanish Public Administrations.

In Spain there are several laws and action plans that demonstrate a great alienation with the EU's sensitivity regarding disability issues, sensitivity that, on the other hand, was already reflected in article 49 of the Spanish Constitution of 1979, in which public authorities are urged to provide the necessary care and protection so that people with disabilities can enjoy their rights.

2.4.4.1 Regulation

Among the measures adopted, the following stand out:

Law 34/2002, of July 11, on Services of the Information Society and Electronic Commerce. Promotes and facilitates the adoption of web accessibility systems. Its Fifth Additional Provision of "Accessibility for persons with disabilities and elderly people to the information provided by electronic means" in which it



obliges to offer accessible contents before December 31, 2005 for all Public Administration offices or those whose design or maintenance are financed through public funds.

Royal Decree 1494/2007, of November 12, which approves the Regulation on the basic conditions for the access of people with disabilities to technologies, products and services related to the information society and social communication media.

According to the Sole Transitional Provision, the terms for Internet pages of Public Administrations or with public financing should be adapted to the provisions of article 5 of said regulation. The deadlines for **all the pages, currently existing or newly created, had to comply with priority 2 of the UNE 139803: 2012.**

The UNE Standard referred to in this Law was published in December 2004 and is comparable to the Web Content Accessibility Guidelines version 1.0 of WCAG (World Wide Web Consortium) coinciding its priority levels.

At the end of 2007, **Law 49/2007, of December 26**, was published, establishing the regime of infractions and sanctions in terms of equal opportunities, non-discrimination and universal accessibility for people with disabilities.

Royal Decree 366/2007, of March 16, which establishes the conditions of accessibility and non-discrimination of persons with disabilities in their relations with the General State Administration, in article 1, seeks to guarantee accessibility and eliminate any discrimination of this group in the access to offices, printed matter, telematic means and any other way of official communication.

Of the conditions of accessibility that the Royal Decree 366/2007, of March 16, contemplates in this context the art. 9, section f, on interactive information systems.

2.4.4.2 Conclusions

Almost none of the public administrations complied with Law 34/2002, of July 11, as of December 31, 2005. In addition, this Law has a significant problem since it does not define a level of accessibility. It says that the pages should be accessible according to the criteria of accessibility to the content generally recognized, it can be described as an ambiguous definition.

Within Law 51/2003, the first action plan developed was the so-called INFO XXI (2001-2003), in which one of its three objectives was to obtain access for all to the Information Society. Once finalized, it was concluded that **its objectives had not been achieved**, so a reedition was necessary. Thus, already under the protection of Law 51/2003 (LIONDAU), two simultaneous plans were created: I National Accessibility Plan (2004-2012), with the main objective of achieving the "Universal Accessibility" of all environments, products and services and the II Action Plan for people with disabilities 2003-2007, which is considered the continuation of the INFOXXI Plan.

According to Royal Decree 1494/2007, from December 31, 2008, all the pages of the Public Administrations should be completely accessible. However, the established deadline was met again, and many, if not all, of the public administration websites remained inaccessible. Law 49/2007, of December 26, establishes the regime of infractions and penalties from € 301 to € 1,000,000. But at present, only some have been imposed in Spain.



The Law 56/2007, of December 28, of Impulse Measures of the Information Society, established the deadline of December 31, 2008, nor was the deadline fulfilled, since most Public Administrations were still not accessible.

On the Royal Decree 366/2007, of March 16, the General Secretariat for Public Administration is the one that determines the Citizen Service Offices that must fulfil the conditions foreseen prior to December 4, 2012. For these purposes, establishes a calendar of gradual adaptation of the Offices, which is still carried out and are subject to updates and periodic monitoring (Temporary Provision, section One)

One can say that the regulatory framework is broad and detailed, but even so, non-compliance is usual, most likely suffers from problems of applicability.

In terms of accessibility, the Regions (autonomous communities) have exclusive competence. Most of them elaborate laws that contain principles, objectives, technical norms that determine how they should be applied in sectors such as audio-visual communication and the digital environment.

Integration plans, actions, projects and agendas on electronic accessibility are being carried out by town councils in Spanish cities. In León, an Accessibility Commission has been created that includes an action plan and includes all the existing regulations regarding Accessibility to achieve digital accessibility in all municipal areas. The City Council of Salamanca draws up an accessibility plan with 40 new measures, including the training of municipal employees in information technologies and support for communication with people with disabilities in digital environments.

According to the I National Accessibility Plan 2004-2012 prepared by the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs through IMSERSO, in Spain the promotion of digital accessibility and others are made up of various agents of administration, instruments and regulations. For a good interaction between them, improvements must be made in the processes by which it is regulated, managed and financed. One example is that Local Administrations fulfil the function of materializing the parameters established in the regional regulations on accessibility, but to reach this objective, action plans and programming and planning instruments must be carried out within their reach, but this it is materialized from necessary priorities such as the budget heading of the municipalities destined to these actions.

As problems that are detected, it should be noted that the policies of new technologies do not incorporate the concept of Design for all in their development. There are few statistical studies and indicators on the level of accessibility in the communication and information sector. In web accessibility we are working continuously from several areas supported in large part by Law 34/2002, but the problem is the speed at which new services and technologies appear that make it impossible to eliminate all barriers.

In terms of IT, the barriers are overcome with technical aids that are considered in hardware and software using the philosophy of Design for all: all the technical standards developed today must be fulfilled.

Public administrations in Spain have for years adopted the necessary measures aimed at providing websites accessible to all citizens. If it is true that it is a slow process, but also a defined and clearly marked objective, with Laws, norms and awareness.



2.4.4.3 References

- [38] LAW 34/2002, of July 11, on services of the information society and electronic commerce.
- [39] LAW 49/2007, of December 26, which establishes the regime of infractions and sanctions in terms of equal opportunities, non-discrimination and universal accessibility for persons with disabilities.
- [40] ROYAL DECREE 1494/2007, of November 12, which approves the Regulation on the basic conditions for the access of people with disabilities to technologies, products and services related to the information society and social media.
- [41] ROYAL DECREE 366/2007, of March 16, which establishes the conditions of accessibility and non-discrimination of persons with disabilities in their relations with the General State Administration.

2.4.5 Regulation about digital accessibility in Education iVET and CVET

The accessibility to digital information in VET is subjected to the following regulations:

- Law 30/2015 [1] which regulates the system of Vocational Education and Training (VET, in Spain named as Formación Profesional) indicates in its Article 14 that “VET for employment could be taught in face-to-face way or as virtual training through platforms and contents which have to be accessible for disabled people, or as blended learning”.
- Royal Decree 694/2017 [2] of 3rd of July which develops Law 30/2015 [1] indicates in its Article 4.2 “[...] e-learning [...] virtual platform [...] teaching [...] and should comply with accessibility and universal design or design requirements for all people which are established by Order of the Minister of Labour, Employment and Social Security.”

2.4.5.1 Regulation

The digital accessibility is also included in general regulation of websites for the Public Administration

- Preamble III of Law 56/2007 [22] in consolidated text published on 28th December 2013, indicates that it includes a reviewed, updated and enhanced version of regulation referred to webpages to ensure accessibility of digital information and for disabled and elder people.
- The 3th Additional Provision of the Law 56/2007 [22] indicates that all the webpages of Public Administration (all state authorities and organisms at national, regional and local level) will satisfy the medium level of the accessibility criteria: only exceptions allowed will be the functionalities or services where no technical solution for accessibility is available. This is also applicable to all webpages totally or partially funded by the Public Administration as well as the ones from entities and companies in charge of managing public services. This will be specifically compulsory for the webpages of all public educational, training and university centres as well as those educational and training centres which get public funds. Public webpages must inform users of their accessibility level and must provide a contact to express any access difficulty to webpages, claims and suggestions for improvement.
- The 5th Additional Provision of the Law 56/2007 [22] states that Public Administration will promote awareness campaigns as well as education and training programs for promoting other webpages progressively adopt accessibility criteria. Failing to fulfil accessibility obligations will be subjected to the regulation of infraction and fines related to the act of equal opportunities, non-discrimination and



universal accessibility for disabled people. The regulation will be also applicable to those companies which provide especially relevant services to the public, so they have to reach the medium level of the accessibility criteria.

- The 11th Additional Provision prescribe that the Public Administration must promote accessibility standards for disabled people and the design for all in all processes and elements of new ICT services in the Information Society.

On the other hand, the “Third Action Plan for Disabled People 2012-2015” [34] from the Community of Madrid points out in section 1.1 “Rights of people with disabilities” (Page 24) that “EU 2020 Strategy” puts forward seven flagships initiatives of which the ones focused on innovation and digitalization must be underlined. In the field of disability these strategies are even further important.

In section 1.3.2 “Services for people with disabilities in the Community of Madrid” and under the heading “Actions to promote Accessibility” the Plan states that the then called “Consejería de Educación y Empleo” (the regional government agency responsible for Education and Employment) has set in its strategic lines to give access to ICT to those groups which are in a situation of social disadvantages and to promote accessibility and adaption for kids with disabilities.

One of the Programmes to achieve the acquired commitment is the ALBOR Programme [35] (Free Barrier Access to the Computer) that deals with the analysis of the especial needs that people with disabilities face when they try to access to the computer and the decision making to achieve universal accessibility.

Also under this heading but related to University Studies in the Community of Madrid it is stated that in the construction of the website www.emes.es the accessibility guidelines corresponding to the level AA verification points (priority 1 and 2 in the UNE 139803:2004 [36] Accessibility in Web content standard) (today replaced by UNE 139803:2012 [37] standard) have been followed, in compliance with Royal Decree 1494/2007 [38] of 12nd November, approving the Regulation on basic conditions for access to technologies, products and services related to information society and social media for people with disabilities.

The “Third Action Plan for Disabled People 2012-2015” [34] also mentions in its Glossary the terms “Easy Reading” and “Support products” (Page 242). An “Easy Reading” document is the one which contains only the most important information presented and expressed in the most direct way so that it could be understandable for the highest number of people. Nevertheless, the Plan only refers to books in libraries, not to digital documents. Despite this it mentions that technology and software are included in the term “Support Products”.

On the other hand, VET for Employment Centres in Madrid include in the Technical Specification Document of the contracts as an obligation of the successful tenderer the economic cost to comply with Law 51/2003 [23] of 2nd December on equal opportunities, non-discrimination and universal accessibility for people with disabilities, in the sense of ensuring the appropriate follow-up of the actions under the contract from people with disabilities. (This Law is today repealed by the Royal Legislative Decree 1/2013 [40] of 29th November approving the Restated Text of the General Law of the Rights of People with Disabilities and their Social Inclusion).



2.4.5.2 Conclusion

There is enough regulation in this area, but it seems not much is applied or at least the efforts have been more focused on physical accessibility to information and communication technologies than on digital accessibility of the contents once you have accessed to the computer. Although there are programmes such as ALBOR, projects like WAMDIA are necessary to make awareness of the importance of digital accessibility to promote initiatives for people to contribute in this area as much as they can.

2.4.5.3 References

- [42] Law 30/2015, 9th September, [regulation of the VET educational system \(Sistema de Formación Profesional\) for employment in the labour environment](#). BOE 10th September, 2015, pag. 79779-79823.
- [43] [Royal Decree 694/2017](#) of 3rd of July which develops Law 30/2015. BOE 5th July, 2017.
- [44] Law 56/2007, 28th December, 2007 with consolidated text published on 28th December 2013, [Measures for promotion of the Information Society](#). BOE 29th December 2007, pag. 53701-53719.
- [45] [“Third Action Plan for Disabled People 2012-2015”](#). Community of Madrid.
- [46] ALBOR Programme ([Free Barrier Access to the Computer](#)).
- [47] UNE 139803:2004 Accessibility in Web content standard.
- [48] [UNE 139803:2012 standard](#).
- [49] [Royal Decree 1494/2007](#) of 12nd November. BOE 21st November 2007
- [50] Law 51/2003 of 2nd December on [equal opportunities, non-discrimination and universal accessibility for people with disabilities](#). BOE 3rd of December 2003.
- [51] Royal Legislative Decree 1/2013 of 29th November approving the [Restated Text of the General Law of the Rights of People with Disabilities and their Social Inclusion](#). BOE 3rd of December 2013.



2.5 Sweden

2.5.1 Introduction

In Sweden the Human Rights, and Global as well as European standards and recommendations has in general been early adopted - and implemented into laws and legislation as well as regulations and recommendations.

2.5.2 Regulation about digital accessibility in Sweden

To define the key term "accessibility" Sweden have used the ISO 26 800:

"What is meant by availability?"

The concept of accessibility is central to the Web Development Guide. This applies in part to the broad importance of information and services being accessible (server accessible, file format readable, security good, performance acceptable and so on). But above all, this means that information and services can be used by all people regardless of, for example, disability (or "widest range of attributes and abilities" as stated in the definition of "accessibility" in the ISO standard 26 800)."

Law and regulations

As a base for law and regulation in Sweden regarding digital accessibility we can find the [Directive \(EU\) 2016/2102 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 26 October 2016 on the accessibility of the websites and mobile applications of public sector bodies](#)

The regulations is also referring to the World Standard - [Web Content Accessibility Guidelines \(WCAG\) 2.0 level AA](#). Created by the [World Wide Web Consortium \(W3C\)](#) (covering 61 criteria divided into 4 categories possible to perceive, manageable, comprehensible and robust.)

Finally, the laws and regulations are also based on the UN "Convention on Human rights" - Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities that was signed by the Swedish Government in 2008.

The decisions and missions are clearly aiming at managing the EU directive during 2018 and also to meet the other deadlines in 2019-2021.

- New websites - 23d September 2019
- Existing Websites - published before the law was introduced - 23d September 2020
- Public "apps" - 23d June 2021

This is very clear when it comes to public bodies, authorities, governmental organizations etc. For the Private Sector there are recommendations but no direct regulations - except for Public Procurement. The laws and regulations are basic requirements in all public bodies' procurement and have to be covered in the tender to be accepted.

The accessibility to digital information in VET is subjected to the following regulations:

- Regulation (2001: 526) on State Authorities Responsibility for Implementing Disability Policy -

Section 1 Government authorities shall design and conduct their activities in consideration of the disability policy objectives.



The authorities shall ensure that people with disabilities receive full participation in social life and equality in living conditions. In particular, the authorities shall ensure that their premises, activities and information are available to persons with disabilities. In this work, the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities shall be indicative. Regulation (2014: 135).

- The Law of discrimination (2008:567): **This general law** aims to counteract discrimination and promote equal rights and opportunities regardless of sex, gender identity or expression, ethnicity, religion or other beliefs, disability, sexual orientation or age. This law is applicable on public as well as private bodies.
- Language Act 2009:600 Plain language: Authorities and public organizations must comply with the Language Act, which states that both the **written and oral language** of public activities should be cared for, simple and comprehensible. That requirement applies to all languages used on the site, not just Swedish. According to the Language Act, authorities are required to communicate in simple and comprehensible Swedish in both direct communication and general information. This applies, for example, to the web, in e-mail, chats or text messages. Similarly, URLs and e-mail addresses should also be in Swedish. This does not prevent the addition of URLs and e-mail addresses in other languages, if the target groups need it.
- ETSI EG 203 350 V1.1.1 (2016-11) PTS (Post och Telestyrelsen - Authority regulation communications in Sweden) wants a wide range of products and services in the field of electronic communications. And that these can be used by everyone, regardless of their ability to work. Thoughtful, substantiated and agreed standards play an important role in ensuring that these products and services can reach as many users as possible in Sweden. For example, PTS participated in a national coordination group that presented Swedish positions in a European standardization that resulted in the standard "Availability Requirements for Public Procurement of ICT Products and Services in Europe (ETSI EN 301 549)". This standard is also translated into Swedish and can be downloaded via its.se/standards.
- The Working Environment Act (AML) prevents ill health and accidents
The Work Environment Act and the Swedish Work Environment Authority's regulations apply to all workplaces in Sweden. The purpose of the Work Environment Act is to prevent ill health and accidents at work and to create a **good working environment** at all workplaces. Responsibility lies with the employer and other so-called protection officers. According to the Work Environment Act, working conditions must be adapted to human conditions both physically and mentally. Both technology, work organization and work content must be designed so that the employee is not subjected to such loads that may result in ill health or accidents.
- The work of the Swedish Agency for Participation is to ensure that disability policy will have an impact in all corners of society.

We work on the premise that everyone is entitled to full participation in society, regardless of functional ability. We do this by



- monitoring and analyzing developments
- proposing methods, guidelines and guidance
- disseminating knowledge
- initiating research and other development work, and
- providing support and proposing measures to government.

We have built up a bank of knowledge on this work, and we track and evaluate developments relating to disability issues at both national and international level. Our task is determined by the goals and strategies of disability policy. These are based on the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. We carry out our work in relation to and on behalf of national authorities, municipalities and county councils.

Luxembourg Recommendations - Inclusive Education: Take Action!

As we can see from above the Swedish Government and Policymakers are supporting the idea and experiences behind the Luxembourg Recommendation:

The Luxembourg Recommendations are in line with and complementary to relevant official European and international documents in the field of special needs and inclusive education. The young people highlighted inclusive education as a human rights issue and placed key concepts, such as normality, tolerance, respect and citizenship, at the center of their discussions.

The full Luxembourg Recommendations are available from the [Inclusive Education – Take Action! Web area](#)

Explanations and definitions

- e-Book "Digital Accessibility" by Per Axbom

A very "typical Swedish" way of taking care of things in practice.

Quote from the e-book - translated from Swedish

"But what does digital accessibility mean?"

It is usually said that there are four types of disabilities addressed:

Visual impairments - different visual disturbances (e.g. color blindness) and different degrees of visual impairment

Motor disabilities - impaired abilities that make people unable to use the tools that are expected to be used to handle a computer, such as involuntary shaking or partial paralysis

Audit impairments - different degrees of inability to perceive noise

Cognitive impairments - a reduced ability to understand and handle information, for example, may depend on a developmental disorder, lack of reading or writing skills or lack of language proficiency

Many believe accessibility is about a separate group of people with clear disabilities that affect their overall ability to handle their everyday lives. It's not like that.

Many disabilities do not appear. They are so-called invisible disabilities. For example, it may be cognitive ability, color blindness or deafness. Some disabilities, such as impaired vision, are also



so common that we do not think of them as obstacles. This is because glasses are a widespread tool that is well integrated into society. The purpose of working with accessibility is to offer more support and tools to more people so that we reduce or eliminate all obstacles that disability would otherwise mean."

The e-book is available online and can be used by anyone - see references below.

2.5.3 Conclusions

Which are covered by the forthcoming laws?

Authorities, county councils, municipalities and other actors classified as public bodies, i.e. actors who are contracting authorities, with some exceptions, must meet the requirements, as well as certain private actors who perform public finance services.

Are laws, regulations and guidelines working in practice?

A very simple conclusion is, of course, the new EU regulation is very well welcomed in Sweden to put focus on not only the needs but also positive opportunities as well as negative consequences of poor availability. The focus will shift from "doing the minimum to fulfil the law" to "what opportunities do we see in making digital information accessible to all".

We will see more of attempts to explaining and giving examples

We can already see some examples and attempts to explain "digital accessibility" and the different existing regulations and laws... But we still miss practical info and training materials for "non IT professionals" on how we can handle this in the daily basis. So far the laws and regulations have been giving a set of "must" actions, there public web-sites and apps are concerned but the information and "how to" are kept in a very small box and not known by all in public.

"Consumer awareness"

As soon as we reach a wider awareness and understanding in this topic - the demands will increase not only from people with recognized disabilities but also from people that so far didn't understand they are having challenges accessing digital information.

When people get used to the public Web Pages and Apps and their accessibility they will also start to demand the same from other publishers like private enterprises, associations, networks etc...

A suggestion could be to update the ECDL

As ECDL has been focusing on the ability to use IT - it could be a good idea to include "producing accessible information" in updated versions.

2.5.4 References

- [52] [Directive \(EU\) 2016/2102 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 26 October 2016 on the accessibility of the websites and mobile applications of public sector bodies](#)
- [53] [Web Content Accessibility Guidelines \(WCAG\)](#) - checklist on "Follow WCAG 2.0" by Swedish Post and Telecom Authority - Published official web site
- [54] UN [Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities](#) - Signed by Swedish Ministry of Foreign Affairs 13th December 2006





- [55] [Regulation \(2001: 526\) on State Authorities Responsibility for Implementing Disability Policy](#) - SFS (Swedish Constitution) 2001:526 changed by SFS 2014:135
- [56] [The Law of Discrimination 2008:567](#) - SFS (Swedish Constitution) 2008:567 Issued on 5th June 2008
- [57] [The Language Act 2009:600](#) - SFS (Swedish Constitution) 2009:600 - by 28th May 2009
- [58] [The Working Environment Act \(AML\)](#) - SFS (Swedish Constitution) 2016:961 - changed through SFS 1977:1160 to 2016:961
- [59] [ETSI EG 203 350 V1.1.1 \(2016-11\)](#) - This ETSI Guide (EG) has been produced by ETSI Technical Committee Human Factors (HF).
- [60] [The Swedish Agency for Participation](#) - official web site
- [61] [Legal requirements for availability](#) - by PTS Swedish Post and Telecom Authority
- [62] [Official Swedish Guide for Web development](#) - by PTS Swedish Post and Telecom Authority
- [63] [Post and Telecom Authorities in EU and Outside EU](#) - Links published by Swedish Post and Telecom Authority - Official Web site
- [64] [Swedish Post and Telecom Authority](#) - official Web site of the Swedish Post and Telecom Authority
- [65] [Digital Accessibility \(Digital Tillgänglighet\) e-Book intro by Per Axbom](#) - First edition March 2013 - Updated edition February 2018
- [66] [ECDL - European Computer Driving License](#) - Published by ECDL Foundation - official web-site
- [67] [Alternative to video - Audio Description and Text](#) - Published by W3C "Understanding WCAG 2.0
- [68] [The Luxembourg Recommendation: Inclusive Education - Take Action!](#) - Presented in 23d November 2015 by European Agency for Special Needs and Inclusive Education

ANNEX I [WCAG 2.0](#)

ANNEX 2 [Convention on the rights of persons with Disabilities](#)

ANNEX 3 [The Luxembourg Recommendation: Inclusive Education - Take Action!](#)



2 Conclusions

Looking at the analysis of regulations of digital accessibility in the five countries involved in the project (Spain, Italy, Sweden, Ireland and Hungary) we can divide the situations into two groups:

- Countries with extensive regulation even already covering many of the aspects of the ones regulated by the EU Directive 2016/2012: Spain and Italy. Regulation in both countries has long history (started in the first decade of 21st Century) but the impression is that the general fulfilment of all the aspect of digital accessibility in the places where it is compulsory (mostly governmental institutions and public administration in general) are very far from being exhaustive and complete. One can find good percentage of public websites implementing measures for digital accessibility in big institutions like Ministries, Regional Government, etc. but smaller organisations such as educational centres or small agencies or municipalities are not working with digital accessibility. Implementation of measures has been always connected to work of IT professionals and many public employees who are only ICT users are not aware of their implication in digital accessibility. Obviously, aspects such as accessible mobile apps are not covered by existing legislation and will need adaptation of regulation to be consistent to EU directive.
- Countries with existing recommendations and some regulation on digital accessibility but lacking an extensive set of legislative measure to make compulsory the digital accessibility at least in governmental and public administration institutions: Ireland, Sweden and Hungary. There are initiatives and voluntary programs in these countries but there are not compulsory regulation for all the public places which will impacted by EU Directive (governmental and public administration institutions and educational centres).

Considering the situation, all the countries would need a strong campaign for rising awareness on the contribution of ICT users to digital accessibility. The work in countries of the second group will be even stronger as the former situation to the new legislation to be adopted due to the EU Directive has not created a sense of consciousness on the obligation of ensuring digital accessibility. This analysis will help the project WAMDIA to better adapt the work in IO2 to the specific situation in each country,

